

Logic Model Scoring Rubric
Museum Examples

There are three sections to the Logic Model Rubric:

- ◇ Plan Section: covers from Stakeholders through the Program Purpose Statement to Activities/Services
- ◇ Individual Outcome Section: covers each element of a single outcome
- ◇ Outcome Scope Section: evaluates how all of the outcomes for a project match the project goals and capacities

Criteria/benchmarking:

An 'acceptable' logic model scores as:

*a **total** of 35 points in the Plan Section (Stakeholders→ Services). Do not average the scores.

*an average score of 2.8 in the Outcomes section (average of all outcomes/indicator statements plus the scope section)

BOTH must be achieved for a passing score.

A "poor" logic model misses the criteria for one or the other section or both.

The example wordings are for a small art museum's 6-week program to teach watercolor painting.

Please note: the example wording is designed for each individual point. The total of the sections does NOT make up an "ideal" logic model. For examples of complete logic models, see the Cases in the Shaping Outcomes course site.

Overall notes:

*In order to save space in the rubric, in some sections the Excellent Column description and examples are in addition to the "Good" column description and examples but do not repeat them. This is noted.

*Sometimes "erroneous placement," or correct items in the wrong sections, is more serious than at other times. For example, placing an outcome in the output section is a serious error. However, describing details of services in the Solution area is not that serious. This is specifically noted in the rubric when it is a common error.

*In most areas, there can be several items listed. An overall guideline for grading these is:

	Poor, needs work 1	2	Good 3	4	Excellent 5
Section with multiple items	None of the items are relevant		A preponderance of the items are correct		All of the items are correct AND no important item is omitted
	2: At least some of the items are relevant			4: All of the items are correct although one or two items may be missing	

PLAN SECTION

Logic Model	Evaluation Criteria				
Plan section	Poor, needs work 1	2	Good 3	4	Excellent 5
Stakeholders	Includes only one entity or group, or none; questions list only what the program does.		Includes the program providers and the audience; includes at least one other stakeholder; includes at least two questions other than “what does the program do?”		Includes program providers, audience, and the most important external stakeholders with questions that encompass more than just services, outputs, or outcomes.
Museum	Museum staff: Do we have to learn watercolor?		Museum staff: What relation does this have to our watercolor collection? Museum visitors: What will it cost in money and time? What kind of instruction will it be? Local arts council: Will this increase visibility of local artists?		<as in Good column plus:> Local gallery owners: Will having people experience art creation increase their desire to purchase art? Museum board: Will this draw new visitors to the museum?
Audience	Is too broad or general, or names ultimate beneficiaries, or names the institution.		Names a group from whom participants in the program can come		Is more specific, and audience members should all have the same program-related need.
Museum	Visitors to Myart Museum		Adults in the Myart Museum region who are interested in learning how to create art.		Adults in the Myart Museum region who are interested in learning how to create art and who have no access to affordable art classes.

Audience needs	Focuses exclusively on institutional needs, or needs of the program or stakeholders.		Most items are focused on the audience, and most directly relate to the program. Should include statements that show the audience has a lack of or have inadequate knowledge, skills, behaviors or attitudes regarding some topic, content or area that needs improvement. Or that a condition exists that is detrimental to the audience that the program can fix.	<as in Good column plus:> Also indicates that some explicit needs assessment has been conducted: data has been gathered to demonstrate needs.
Museum	The watercolor collections at the Myart Museum are underappreciated, with less visitor traffic than other areas.		There are no adult community education course offerings in the Mytown area covering art creation.	Fifty people wrote in the “suggestions” area of the annual survey of Myart membership that they were interested in learning how to create art.
Audience considerations	Focuses exclusively on program providers or the nature of the program topic.		Lists several characteristics of the audience members as well as of the program, the institution or the subject matter that will affect how the program is designed. Most items are audience-centered.	<as in Good column plus> Comprehensively lists major characteristics that will affect how (not why) the program is delivered.
Museum	The museum’s staffing only allows Saturday not Sunday hours.		If a high percentage of class members are senior citizens, they may not be able to stand at easels for long periods or may have difficulty gripping brushes, etc. (etc.)	<These are highly dependent upon the particular program. Check that all Items are tied to inputs, activities, and services later in the model>.
Solution	Too vague, or language refers to the institution, or to ultimate beneficiaries.		A concise description of the program itself. It may include some details that are better placed in other sections.	A concise description that is meaningful but avoids details that belong in other sections.
Museum	Museum visitors come to painting classes.		Myart Museum advertises and then signs people up for a series of painting sessions where participants learn watercolor skills.	Myart Museum provides a six-session watercolor painting class.

Desired results	Results are too broad or long-term; mentions institutional reputation; lists just the activities (or products or tools developed) not outcomes.	Results are audience-specific and reasonable to the scope of the program; may not be as concrete as outcomes statements; might include some technical language.	Results are clear, specific, concrete, and concern changes in the audience. Language is understandable by non-specialists.
Museum	More people become members of Myart Museum. Mytown residents appreciate art more.	Class participants learn how to wash, hatch, shade, over-lay, point, grid-cross, and moiré by the end of the sessions.	Class participants will learn the most important technical skills of watercolor painting.
Program purpose statement			
We do what	Inconsistent with the 'solution' section; too broad.	Specific to the particular program and within the capacity of the providers; may include some detail that is better placed elsewhere.	Specific, concise, and sequentially ordered
Museum	The Museum makes art accessible to all people.	The Museum offers Saturday classes on watercolor painting.	A museum provides a program to teach the basics of watercolor painting on six consecutive Saturdays.
For whom	Includes possible or potential beneficiaries rather than specific participants; is too broad.	Specifies a particular audience.	Specific and carefully distinguishes different audiences.
Museum	Watercolor enthusiasts	Myart Museum members and visitors.	Adult Myart Museum members and visitors. [potentially: Local art teachers, if they are specifically targeted.]
For what outcome	Describes what the institution does or describes the experiences of participants. Gives a broad program rationale; does not mention participant change; is incompatible with other LM sections.	Specific and targeted towards a change in the audience. This may be somewhat broadly stated (since it might encompass more than one specific outcome), but it will be anchored in the audience and change. Avoids weak verbs such as "be aware" (prefer, "knows" or does).	<as in Good column, plus:> Is particularly concrete, consistent with the program scope, and aimed at audience needs. Sequentially mentions desired participant changes (immediate, intermediate, long-term if applicable).

Museum	To increase appreciation of watercolor art. To create more museum supporters.		Workshop attendees know watercolor techniques.		Workshop attendees know specific beginning watercolor techniques.
Inputs	Blank, or includes too few or too many details.		Presents the most important inputs involved in both the administration and delivery of the program; a few inputs may be too broad or too detailed.		Lists all important categories of materials, services and other issues that will make the program possible, without being as detailed as a budget.
Museum	Paint, easels. <omits instructor, space, etc.>		Brushes in six different sizes <too detailed> Easels, drop cloths, and canvases Staff time <too vague> Evaluation forms, outside evaluator		Consumable painting supplies such as brushes, canvases, and cloths (set a participation fee) Foundation support for durable equipment such as easels and drop cloths Instructor Evaluation design and administration (outside consultant) Museum media for advertising
Outputs— Apply one score to the combined quality of input, activity and service outputs.	Includes outcomes. Items not phrased as counts. Shows outputs for only inputs or activities (omits services).		Quantifies items including at least one activity and one service; does not include any outcomes. Avoids too much detail.		Quantifies all of the most important inputs, activities and services for determining if the program is on-track.

Museum (I=input, A=activity, S=service)	Participants learn to paint. Pictures of Picasso, da Vinci, Pollack, Koons, Kingston, Murphy, and O'Keefe acquired.	A: Number of painting kits prepared S: Number of participants S: Amount of supplies consumed	I: Cost of supplies consumed net of participant fees I: Total cost of rental, instructor, and unreimbursed supplies A: Number of evaluations completed; number of painting kits prepared S: Number of initial participants and number of completing participants
Activities	Includes services. Misses a key activity. (Quantification goes in the Outputs area)	Includes at least some important administrative and preparatory tasks	Lists all important back-office functions needed to prepare for, manage, and evaluate the program.
Museum	Offer watercolor classes <a service> <omits arranging for an instructor—on staff or outside>	Arrange for the room for the class to be available with brushes, easels, drop cloths, and washing supplies the right equipment every Saturday <too wordy> Hire instructor Buy supplies Register participants	Arrange physical facilities for each class session Hire instructor Hire evaluator Advertise and register participants Prepare gallery for after-class show
Services	Includes activities. Omits the main program	A short description of what the program does—everything here is done <i>with, to, and for</i> program participants. Everything is consistent with the “solution” and “we do what” sections. May give too few or too many details.	No inclusion of erroneous items; description is concise and direct (and probably shorter than other sections)
Museum	<omits Classes in watercolor painting>	Give painting classes.	Provide six watercolor painting classes on consecutive Saturday mornings

INDIVIDUAL OUTCOME SECTION

Score EACH outcome separately, and then score for “scope” at the end.
 AVERAGE the scores for outcomes, multiple indicators, and scope.

Logic Model	Individual Outcome Grid				
Outcomes section	Poor, needs work 1	2	Good 3	4	Excellent 5
Outcomes statement— audience focus	Statement does not start with the participants who are part of the project audience.		Statement begins with the group from which program participants come.		Statement begins with people who have been identified as in need of the program and specifies participants.
Museum	Watercolors are more appreciated by the public.		Art lovers develop watercolor skills.		Workshop attendees develop watercolor skills.
Outcome statement— change	Outcome is expressed in terms of experiences or activities, or attitude towards the program, not outcomes.		Outcome is phrased as a change in participant skills, attitude, knowledge, behavior, status or condition. <Some wording may be more appropriate to the indicator or data source section.>		<as in Good, plus:> The outcome is specific and does not include extra elements.
Museum	Participants paint watercolors.		Participants learn watercolor painting skills through attending classes. <slightly non specific, plus describes process as well as outcome>		Workshop attendees learn five specific watercolor painting skills.
Indicator	The indicator is a broad category (a data source), or contains output not outcome information.		Using the specific format (# and % of program participants who X), the indicator describes a quantity and level of observable data that would indicate that the outcome has been achieved.		As in “Good” plus the indicator includes quantity and level of specific measurement tools (e.g. individual survey or test items or tasks); no format or substance errors.
Museum	Observation of painting classes. Number of participants in each class.		The # and % of participants whose final paintings are judged to incorporate the techniques included in the instruction.		The # and % of participants whose final paintings, judged by observers, exhibit at least three of five specific watercolor techniques without more than one technique error.

Data Source	Nothing is given or data source could not contain the needed information.		A data source is named, which could be designed to contain the relevant information.		A data source is named that is the best source of the outcomes information, and includes specifics about where the source comes from.
Museum	Visitor count		Participant paintings		Expert evaluations of participant paintings.
Applied To	Nothing given, or references an entire audience		Specifically references people who have benefited from the program.		Gives details which include not just participation but a level of participation; uses a sample if appropriate
Museum	Visitors		Participants		Participants who have attended at least 60% of the class sessions.
Data Interval	No data interval is given, or it is clearly inappropriate to the measure/outcome		Interval is given but it is not specific enough		Interval is given, is appropriate to the outcome and is specific
Museum	At beginning of program		After end of program		The second and the last instructional class sessions <an improvement outcome>.
Target	No target given, or target is clearly inappropriate to the project as described or target describes audience as a whole, not participants		Target is given, and is relevant to the size of the participants. Target does not include a percentage <i>Put 'level' of achievement in the Indicator section.</i>		Target is given in percentage terms, and is reasonable according to instructor and participant understanding of the program.
Museum	100		20		75% of participants.

SCOPE SECTION

Logic Model	Evaluation Criteria				
Scope section	Poor, needs work 1	2	Good 3	4	Excellent 5
Taken all together, do the outcomes match capacities of the program and needs of the audience?	Outcomes do not relate to the program's activities and services (are much broader or narrower)		Outcomes are specific to the program but there may be a mismatch between program scope and long- or medium- or short-term goals.		Outcomes are those that can be both achieved and measured within the specific project. All important outcomes are mentioned.
Museum	Art appreciation		Participants know how to paint. <i>(too broad)</i>		<i>This will vary according to the project as described, and both instructor and student expertise in librarianship and museum activities.</i>